# Shooting of Tamir Rice

The shooting of Tamir Rice, a 12-year-old boy (June 25, 2002 - November 23, 2014), occurred on November 22, 2014, in Cleveland, Ohio. Two police officers, 26-year-old Timothy Loehmann and 46-year-old Frank Garmback, responded after receiving a police dispatch call "of a male black sitting on a swing and pointing a gun at people" in a city park.[1][2][3] A caller reported that a male was pointing "a pistol" at random people in the Cudell Recreation Center. At the beginning of the call and again in the middle he says of the pistol "it's probably fake."[4] Toward the end of the two-minute call, the caller stated "he is probably a juvenile." [5] However, this information was not relayed to Loehmann or Garmback on the initial dispatch. [6][7] The officers reported that upon their arrival, Rice reached towards a gun in his waistband. Loehmann fired two shots before the zone car came to a halt<sup>[8]</sup> and within two seconds of arriving on the scene,<sup>[9]</sup> hitting Rice once in the torso. [2][10] Neither officer administered any first aid to Rice after the shooting. He died on the following day.<sup>[11]</sup>

Rice's gun was later found to be an Airsoft replica that lacked the orange safety feature marking it as a replica and not a true firearm. A surveillance video of the shooting was released by police four days later, on November 26. A statement in which they declared their investigation to be completed and that they had turned their findings over to the county prosecutor, who will review the report and decide whether to present evidence to a grand jury.

In the aftermath of the shooting, it was reported that Loehmann, in his previous job as a policeman in Independence, Ohio, had been deemed an emotionally unstable recruit and unfit for duty.<sup>[16]</sup> The incident received national and international coverage, in part due to the time of its occurrence, coming shortly after the police shootings of several other black males.

# 1 Shooting

In a 9-1-1 call, a caller, who was sitting in a nearby gazebo, reported that someone, possibly a juvenile, was pointing "a pistol" at random people in the Cudell Recreation Center. The caller twice said that the gun was "probably fake," but was unable to identify if the weapon was real or not; the orange barrel markings used to identify toy weapons had been removed. [17] According to police spokesmen, it was initially unclear if that information was

relayed to the dispatched officers, Loehmann and Garmback, and it was later revealed that the dispatcher did not elaborate beyond referencing "a gun." [12][18] According to one report, the 9-1-1 responder twice asked whether the boy was black or white [19] before dispatching officers to the park at around 3:30 p.m. [17] The actual recording of the phone call reveals that the 9-1-1 responder asked whether the boy was black or white three times; however, the question was repeated only after the caller continued describing the color of Rice's clothing. [20] The caller then left the gazebo, and Rice sat down in it sometime later. [18]

According to information reported to the press on the day of the shooting by Cleveland Police Patrolmen's Association President Jeffrey Follmer, "[Loehmann and Garmback] pulled into the parking lot and saw a few people sitting underneath a pavilion next to the center. [Loehmann] saw a black gun sitting on the table, and he saw the boy pick up the gun and put it in his waistband."[21] Also on that date, Cleveland Deputy Chief Tomba stated, "The officer got out of the car and told the boy to put his hands up. The boy reached into his waistband, pulled out the gun and [Loehmann] fired two shots." According to Chief Tomba, "the child did not threaten the officer verbally or physically."[12][13][21] On November 26, the day a video of the shooting was released, Chief Tomba is quoted as saying, "Loehmann shouted from the car three times at Tamir to show his hands as he approached the car."[2] The entire incident happened in less than two seconds. [22] The officers later found that the gun was an Airsoft gun, which are air gun replicas of real guns and are designed to shoot non-lethal plastic pellets, which had had its orange safety tip removed. Rice died the day after the shooting at MetroHealth Medical Center. The medical examiner clarified the cause of death as being a gunshot wound to the torso, with injuries to major vessels, intestines, and the pelvis.[11] The Cuyahoga County Medical Examiner's Office autopsy says Tamir was 5 feet 7 inches (1.70 m) and weighed 195 pounds (88 kg).[23]

A surveillance video without audio of the shooting was released by police on November 26 after pressure from the public and Rice's family. [14] It showed Rice pacing around the park, occasionally extending his right arm with what could be a gun in his hand, talking on a cellphone, and sitting at a picnic table in a gazebo. The video shows a patrol car driving at a high rate of speed across the park lawn and then stopping abruptly by the gazebo. Loehmann then jumps out of the car and immediately shoots Rice from a distance of less than 10 feet (3.0 m). [17][18][24] According to Judge Ronald B. Adrine in a judgement entry on the

2 3 AFTERMATH

case "this court is still thunderstruck by how quickly this event turned deadly.... On the video the zone car containing Patrol Officers Loehmann and Garmback is still in the process of stopping when Rice is shot." [8]

Neither Loehmann nor Garmback administered any first aid to Rice after the shooting. [25] Almost four minutes later, a police detective and an agent from the Federal Bureau of Investigation, the latter of whom was working a bank robbery detail nearby, arrived on the scene and treated the boy. Three minutes after that, paramedics arrived and took him to MetroHealth Medical Center. [26][27][28]

Rice's mother said that the toy gun had been given to him to play with by a friend minutes before the police arrived, that police tackled and put her 14-year-old daughter in handcuffs after the incident, and that police threatened her with arrest if she did not calm down after being told about her son's shooting.<sup>[29]</sup>

A second video obtained by the Northeast Ohio Media Group and released on January 7, 2015, shows Rice's 14-year-old sister being forced to the ground, handcuffed and placed in a patrol car after she ran toward her brother about two minutes after the shooting. It also shows that police waited for four minutes before providing any first aid to Rice.<sup>[30]</sup>

## 2 Police officers involved

In the aftermath of the shooting, media outlets reported on the background of the police officers involved. Both officers have been placed on administrative leave.<sup>[31]</sup>

#### 2.1 Timothy Loehmann

Loehmann, who fired the shots that killed Rice, joined Cleveland's police force in March 2014. In 2012, he had spent five months with the police department in Independence, about 13 miles (21 km) south of Cleveland, with four of those months spent in the police academy.

In a memo to Independence's human resources manager, released by the city in the aftermath of the shooting, Independence deputy police chief Jim Polak wrote that Loehmann had resigned rather than face certain termination due to concerns that he lacked the emotional stability to be a police officer. Polak said that Loehmann was unable to follow "basic functions as instructed". He specifically cited a "dangerous loss of composure" that occurred in a weapons training exercise, during which Loehmann's weapons handling was "dismal" and he became visibly "distracted and weepy" as a result of relationship problems. The memo concluded, "Individually, these events would not be considered major situations, but when taken together they show a pattern of a lack of maturity, indiscretion and not following instructions, I do not believe

time, nor training, will be able to change or correct these deficiencies." It was subsequently revealed that Cleveland police officials never reviewed Loehmann's personnel file from Independence prior to hiring him.<sup>[16][32]</sup>

### 2.2 Frank Garmback

Garmback, who was driving the police cruiser, has been a police officer in Cleveland since 2008. In 2014, the City of Cleveland paid US\$100,000 to settle an excessive force lawsuit brought against him by a local woman; according to her lawsuit, Garmback "rushed and placed her in a chokehold, tackled her to the ground, twisted her wrist and began hitting her body" and "such reckless, wanton and willful excessive use of force proximately caused bodily injury". The woman had called the police to report a car blocking her driveway.<sup>[33]</sup> The settlement does not appear in Garmback's personnel file.<sup>[34]</sup>

## 3 Aftermath

## 3.1 Investigation

The Cleveland Police Department received statements from both Loehmann and Garmback. They announced they were looking for additional witnesses to the shooting, including a man who was recorded walking with Rice in the park before the shooting. Their results will be presented to a grand jury for possible charges. [28]

On January 1, 2015, the Associated Press reported that Cleveland police department officials were looking for an outside agency to investigate the Rice shooting, as well as handle all future investigations related to deadly use-of-force incidents.<sup>[35]</sup>

On May 15, Mother Jones magazine reported that, six months after the shooting, while the sheriff's department announced that it had almost concluded its investigation of the shooting, neither of the two officers involved had yet been interviewed by investigators from the Cuyahoga County Sheriff's Office. It also reported that as of that time Frank Garmback, the officer who drove the police car, was not under criminal investigation. [36]

On June 3, the Cuyahoga County Sheriff's Office released a statement in which they declared their investigation to be completed and that they turned their findings over to prosecutor Tim McGinty, who is expected to review the report and decide whether to present evidence to a grand jury. [15] In response to a petition from citizens, on June 11 Municipal Court Judge Ronald Adrine agreed that "Officer Timothy Loehmann should be charged with several crimes, the most serious of them being murder but also including involuntary manslaughter, reckless homicide, negligent homicide and dereliction of duty." Judge Adrine also found probable cause to charge Officer Frank Garmback with "negligent homicide and dereliction of duty."

His opinion was forwarded to city prosecutors and Cuyahoga County Prosecutor Timothy McGinty, who as of that date had not yet come to a decision on whether to present the evidence to a grand jury.<sup>[37]</sup>

#### 3.1.1 Report

On June 13, Cuyahoga County Prosecutor Tim McGinty released a redacted 224-page report of the investigation. The report includes interviews with at least 27 people, including teachers, friends, and the person that called 911. Loehmann and Garmback declined to be interviewed.

The report includes accounts from several witnesses, none of whom heard officers issue a warning to Rice before opening fire, contradicting statements made by police that Loehmann shouted "show your hands" three times before firing.<sup>[40]</sup>

Two independent conclusions about the use of force were submitted to the Cuyahoga County prosecutor's office by outside experts, one by retired FBI agent Kimberly Crawford, a second by Colorado prosecutor S. Lamar Sims. Both reported that the shooting of Tamir Rice was reasonable under the circumstances.<sup>[41]</sup>

## 3.2 Inconsistencies in police account

The initial account was given by Deputy Chief of Field Operations Ed Tomba, before the video emerged:<sup>[21]</sup>

- 1. Police said that Rice was seated at a table with other people. The video showed that Rice was alone. [42]
- 2. Police said that as they pulled up, they saw Rice grab the toy gun and put it in his waistband. This is not supported by the video.<sup>[43]</sup> Judge Adrine said the video does not show the toy gun in Rice's hands in the moments immediately before as the zone car approaches.<sup>[8]</sup>
- Police said they got out of the car and told Rice three times to put his hands up but he refused. The video shows Rice being shot almost immediately after Loehmann exits the vehicle. [8][44]
- 4. Police said that Rice then reached into his waistband and pulled out the toy gun, and was then shot and killed by Officer Timothy Loehmann. The video shows that Rice did not pull out the toy gun.<sup>[44]</sup> In the video, Rice is using both hands to hold his shirt up and expose the pellet gun to view just before he falls to the ground.
- 5. Police described the toy gun as looking real and later explained that the neon tip of the toy gun was missing. [9] However the police never saw Rice brandish or point the pistol at them to determine if the orange cap was actually missing or not. [9]

## 3.3 Wrongful death claim

On December 5, 2014, Rice's family filed a wrongful death claim against Loehmann, Garmback, and the City of Cleveland in the United States District Court for the Northern District of Ohio. The eight-page claim accused Loehmann and Garmback of acting "unreasonably, negligently [and] recklessly" and that "[h]ad the defendant officers properly approached Tamir and properly investigated his possession of the replica gun they would undoubtedly have determined ... that the gun was fake and that the subject was a juvenile". It also accused the City of Cleveland for failing to properly train both officers, as well as failing to learn about the Independence police department's internal memo about Loehmann. [45][46][47] A U.S. District Court will hold a hearing in June 2015 to decide whether to delay the lawsuit while the criminal investigation is still pending. [48]

#### 3.4 Protests

In the wake of the shooting, protests and public outcry broke out in Cleveland, although they were relatively minor. However, on November 25, 2014, a day after a grand jury decision to not indict the police officer who fatally shot Michael Brown, the Cleveland protests became more prominent. That day, about 200 protesters marched from Public Square to the Cleveland Memorial Shoreway, causing the latter to be shut down temporarily. [14][28] Rice's family pleaded with the protesters to remain peaceful in their activities, saying, "Again, we ask for the community to remain calm. Please protest peacefully and responsibly." [49]

On December 5, Ohio Governor John Kasich established a task force to address community-police relations in response to Rice's shooting and other similar incidents.<sup>[50]</sup>

Rice's death has been cited as one of several police killings which 'sparked' the nationwide Black Lives Matter movement. [51][52][53]

## 3.5 Media coverage

The incident received national and international coverage, in part due to the time of its occurrence, coming shortly after the recent police shooting of Michael Brown in Ferguson, Missouri; the death of Eric Garner in Staten Island, New York; the police shooting of Akai Gurley in Brooklyn, New York just two days before; the shooting of John Crawford III in Dayton, Ohio; and the subsequent unrest following these incidents had attracted worldwide attention.

The Northeast Ohio Media Group was criticized for publishing a news story on Rice's parents' criminal records. [54][55]

4 REFERENCES

#### 3.6 **Funeral service**

A funeral service for Rice was held at the Mount Sinai Baptist Church on December 3, 2014, with about 250 people in attendance. He was remembered "for his budding talents and described [him] as a popular child who liked to draw, play basketball and perform in the school's drum line." Family members criticized Loehmann for acting too quickly in Rice's shooting. [56][57]

## See also

- Shooting of Andy Lopez
- · Shooting of Michael Brown
- Shooting of John Crawford III
- · Shooting of Ezell Ford
- Death of Eric Garner

#### 5 References

- [1] "Tamir Rice Shooting Cleveland Police Dispatch Radio". YouTube. November 24, 2014.
- [2] Izadi, Elahe; Holley, Peter (November 26, 2014). "Video shows Cleveland officer shooting 12-year-old Tamir Rice within seconds". Washington Post. Retrieved November 26, 2014.
- [3] Tom McCarthy in New York, Tamir Rice: video shows boy, 12, shot 'seconds' after police confronted child guardian.com. Retrieved November 26, 2014.
- [4] Tamir Rice Shooting: Tamir Rice Shooting 911 Call Released By Cleveland Police Tamir Rice Video. YouTube. November 26, 2014.
- [5] "Tamir Rice Shooting: Tamir Rice Shooting 911 Call Released By Cleveland Police Tamir Rice Video". YouTube. November 26, 2014.
- [6] "Cleveland cop who killed 12-year-old Tamir Rice not told boy's age". NY Daily News. Retrieved December 13, 2014.
- [7] "Tamir Rice shooting: Officers were not told the gun could be fake or that suspect was juvenile". newsnet5.com - Cleveland. Retrieved November 24, 2014.
- [8] "Judgement entry on Tamir Rice case". scribd.com. WKYC.com. June 11, 2015. Retrieved October 14, 2015.
- [9] http://www.dailykos.com/story/2014/12/04/1349386/ -New-lie-in-the-shooting-death-of-Tamir-Rice-discovered [30] lidd อเลืองเกาะเลือง รักษาเกาะ ให้เลือง เป็นเลือง เป็นเล้า เป็นเลือง เป็นเลือง เป็นเล้า เป็นเล dailykos.com 2014/12/04
- [10] Ferrell, Nikki (November 26, 2014). "Cleveland Police name Timothy Loehmann, officer who shot Tamir Rice, 12, on west side". Scripps TV Station Group. Retrieved November 27, 2014.

[11] MacDonald, Evan (November 24, 2014). "Cause of death released for 12-year-old boy shot by Cleveland police". Retrieved November 26, 2014.

- [12] Fitzsimmons, Emma (November 23, 2014). "12-Year-Old Boy Dies After Police in Cleveland Shoot Him". New York Times. Retrieved November 25, 2014.
- [13] "Tamir Rice: US police kill boy, 12, carrying replica gun". BBC. November 24, 2014. Retrieved November 25, 2014.
- [14] "Protests break out in Cleveland over Tamir Rice shooting, Ferguson grand jury decision". cleveland.com.
- [15] "Tamir Rice investigation complete, going to prosecutor". WKCY. Retrieved June 8, 2015.
- [16] Mai-Duc, Christine. "Cleveland officer who killed Tamir Rice had been deemed unfit for duty". Los Angeles Times. Retrieved December 5, 2014.
- [17] "Cleveland police officer shot Tamir Rice immediately after leaving moving patrol car". cleveland.com.
- [18] "Video Shows Cleveland Cop Shoot 12-Year-Old Tamir Rice Within Seconds". NBC News.
- [19] "12-year-old boy playing with fake gun dies after being shot by Ohio police".
- [20] "911 caller: 12-year-old boy shot by US police probably had a 'fake' gun". youtube.com.
- [21] "Cleveland police officer shoots 12-year-old boy carrying BB gun". cleveland.com.
- [22] "Tamir Rice shooting video shows cop shot him within 2 seconds"
- [23] WKYC Staff, WKYC (December 12, 2014). "Tamir Rice autopsy report released". WKYC.
- [24] "Video: Cop shot boy seconds after encountering him". Yahoo News. November 26, 2014.
- [25] Caroline Bankoff (November 29, 2014). "Cops Who Shot Tamir Rice Didn't Bother to Give Him First Aid". New York Magazine.
- [26] "Police Who Shot 12-Year-Old Tamir Rice Did Not Give Him First Aid". TPM.
- [27] "12-Year-Old Boy's Fatal Shooting By Cops Could Have Been Avoided: Family". The Huffington Post.
- [28] "Video shows Cleveland officer shooting 12-year-old Tamir Rice within seconds". Washington Post.
- [29] "Family of Boy Killed by Cleveland Officer to Pursue Criminal Case". The New York Times. Retrieved December 9, 2014.
- ing Shows Police Arresting Sister, Delaying First Aid". The Huffington Post.
- [31] "Family of Tamir Rice, 12-year-old Cleveland boy fatally shot by police, question cops' training, call death avoidable". nydailynews.com.

- [32] "Cleveland officer who fatally shot Tamir Rice judged unfit for duty in 2012". The Guardian. Retrieved December 5, 2014.
- [33] "Cleveland paid out \$100,000 to woman involving excessive force lawsuit against officer in Tamir Rice shooting". Cleveland.com. Retrieved December 5, 2014.
- [34] "Justice Department's scathing review; another excessive force lawsuit". Cleveland.com. Retrieved December 5, 2014.
- [35] "Cleveland Seeks Outside Probe In Tamir Rice Shooting". Associated Press. January 1, 2015. Retrieved January 28, 2015.
- [36] Lee, Jaeah. "It's Been 6 Months Since Tamir Rice Died, and the Cop Who Killed Him Still Hasn't Been Questioned". *Mother Jones.com*. Mother Jones and the Foundation for National Progres. Retrieved 18 May 2015.
- [37] Graham, David A. (June 11, 2015). "'Probable Cause' in the Killing of Tamir Rice". The Atlantic. Retrieved June 12, 2015.
- [38] "Tamir Rice investigation released by Cleveland prosecutors". Los Angeles Times. Retrieved June 13, 2015.
- [39] "Witness accounts in Tamir Rice investigation paint vivid picture of events". Cleveland.com. Retrieved June 13, 2015.
- [40] "Tamir Rice investigation released: The Big Story". Cleveland.com. Archived from the original on June 14, 2015. Retrieved June 14, 2015.
- [41] "Reports find shooting of Tamir Rice reasonable". Reuters. Retrieved 11 October 2015.
- [42] "I hereby charge Timothy Loehmann and the Cleveland PD with the murder of 12-year-old Tamir Rice". *dailykos.com*.
- [43] http://www.nbcnews.com/news/us-news/video-shows-cleveland-cop-shoot-12-year-old-tamir-rice-n256656
- [44] "How reliable is police testimony?". MSNBC.
- [45] "Family of Tamir Rice, 12-Year-Old Shot By Cop, Files Wrongful Death Suit". NBC News.
- [46] "Tamir Rice's family files wrongful death suit against Cleveland police officers fox8.com". *fox8.com*.
- [47] "Tamir Rice's family files wrongful death lawsuit after fatal shooting of 12-year-old in Cleveland". Washington Post.
- [48] "Judge to consider delaying lawsuit against cops who shot Tamir Rice". NBC (WKYC). Retrieved May 20, 2015.
- [49] "Tamir Rice's family plead with supporters to stay peaceful amid fears of more violent protests - Daily Mail Online". Mail Online.
- [50] "Kasich police commission Ferguson Beavercreek". daytondailynews.com.

- [51] Williams, Yohuru. "You're Nobody 'Till Somebody Kills You: Baltimore, Freddie Gray and the Problem of History". *Huffington Post*. Retrieved May 29, 2015.
- [52] Fields, Liz. "After Walter Scott Killing, Black Lives Matter Movement Calls For Citizen Oversight of Police". Vice News. Retrieved May 26, 2015.
- [53] "Activists blast NYPD attempts to silence movement for change". Black Lives Matter. Retrieved May 24, 2015.
- [54] Daniel Politi (November 28, 2014). "Cleveland Paper Thinks You Should Know Tamir Rice's Father Has Abused Women". Slate.
- [55] Nick Wing (November 26, 2014). "Police Gunned Down A 12-Year-Old And Somehow Local News Decided To Run This Story". Huffington Post.
- [56] Nicole Hensley, "Tamir Rice's family blasts police at boy's Cleveland funeral", New York Daily News, December 3, 2014.
- [57] "Tears at Funeral for Cleveland Boy Tamir Rice Shot by Cop". NBC News. December 3, 2014. Retrieved May 12, 2015.

## 6 External links

- Video footage of the shooting
- Use of Deadly Force by Law Enforcement Officers (Connecticut)

## 7 Text and image sources, contributors, and licenses

### **7.1** Text

• Shooting of Tamir Rice Source: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Shooting\_of\_Tamir\_Rice?oldid=693426798 Contributors: Darkonc, WhisperToMe, Pigsonthewing, Acrider, HangingCurve, Mike Rosoft, Smyth, Bender235, Ricky81682, Titanium Dragon, WadeSim-Miser, Kelisi, Bgwhite, True Pagan Warrior, Yamaguchi@, Gilliam, Hmains, Toughpigs, George Ho, Dbdb, Naaman Brown, Xionbox, Megannnn, Bellerophon5685, Argymeg, Wormcast, KConWiki, Gandydancer, Paris1127, Shawn in Montreal, Arms & Hearts, Nwbeeson, Thick650, Wikimandia, Saturn star, Falcon8765, Flyer22 Reborn, Frank Anchor, Paulinho28, Gene93k, Niceguyedc, JoelDick, Conphlikt, Yobot, BoringHistoryGuy, AnomieBOT, Cyanidethistles, Materialscientist, TracyMcClark, GliderMaven, Gourami Watcher, MrX, RAN1, Ghostofnemo, Jim Michael, Inkyhack, Illegitimate Barrister, Unreal7, ClueBot NG, Johngimi, Somedifferentstuff, Rainydaydr, Widr, Anupmehra, Daviddwd, Starship.paint, Benefac, GrammarFascist, 220 of Borg, Yxesmai12, MeanMotherJr, Cwobeel, Bsa492, Frosty, Epicgenius, Jp4gs, Everymorning, Dwscomet, ArmbrustBot, Shiningrood, Bilorv, JudgeJason, Trackteur, Mazaexperience, ShulMaven, DissidentAggressor, Libertarian12111971, Tommynewsnetwork, ChamithN, FourViolas, Eteethan, Drugzarebad69, StealthyJoker85, AutonomousOrangePages, Manofpeace87, Cathar66, Ladygagafan1512, Western jonh 2, Harmony109, Nøkkenbuer, Mico Antonio1234, Youareagrt, Msgoldsby74, MXfurry, Peytonmanning98, TomJoadsGhost, Josephp18810, Versus001, 75quidnunc, Plutatico13, Coreysutphin and Anonymous: 87

## 7.2 Images

- File:Flag\_of\_Ohio.svg Source: https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/4/4c/Flag\_of\_Ohio.svg License: Public domain Contributors: Construction sheet, also at [1] (see patent filing) Original artist: Designed by John Eisenmann, SVG code by <a href='//commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/User:SiBr4' title='User:SiBr4'>SiBr4</a>
- File:Samsung\_Galaxy\_S5\_Vector.svg Source: https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/1/15/Samsung\_Galaxy\_S5\_Vector.svg License: CC BY-SA 3.0 Contributors: Own work Original artist: Rafael Fernandez

### 7.3 Content license

• Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 3.0